

## **SUPREME COURT OF INDIA**

This file relates to the proposal for appointment of the following four Advocates and one Judicial Officer as Judges of the Jammu & Kashmir High Court:

### **ADVOCATES**

1. Shri Wasim Sadiq Nargal,
2. Shri Nazir Ahmed Beig,
3. Smt. Sindhu Sharma,
4. Shri Showkat Ahmad Makroo, and

### **JUDICIAL OFFICER:**

5. Shri Rashid Ali Dar.

The above recommendation was made by the then Chief Justice of the Jammu & Kashmir High Court on 24<sup>th</sup> August 2017, in consultation with his two senior-most colleagues.

At present, there is no Judge in the Supreme Court conversant with the affairs of the Jammu & Kashmir High Court to ascertain suitability of the above-named recommendees.

In order to assess merit and suitability of the above-named recommendees for elevation to the High Court, we have carefully scrutinized the material placed in the file which includes the views of the Chief Minister and the Governor for the State of Jammu & Kashmir, complaints against the recommendations and reports / comments thereon of the Intelligence Agencies, their age, income, statistics of reported / unreported judgments and pro bono cases handled by the Bar members, as well as the observations made by the Department of Justice in the file. As regards Shri Rashid Ali Dar, Judicial Officer, we have also considered his service record, report of Judgment Assessment Committee, ACRs and also the fact that on the date of vacancy he was below 58-1/2 years and thus qualifies the

age criterion applicable to a Judicial Officer recommended for elevation. Apart from this, we invited all the recommendees with a view to have an interaction with them. On the basis of the interaction we had with the recommendees and having regard to all relevant factors, the Collegium is of the considered view that S/Shri (1) Shri Wasim Sadiq Nargal, (2) Shri Nazir Ahmed Beig, (3) Smt. Sindhu Sharma, Advocates and (4) Shri Rashid Ali Dar, Judicial Officer are suitable for being appointed as Judges of the Jammu & Kashmir High Court.

As regards Shri Showkat Ahmad Makroo, Advocate (mentioned at Sl. No. 4 above) having regard to the material on record, we are of the considered view that consideration of his case can wait. The proposal for his elevation is accordingly deferred for the present.

In view of the above, the Collegium resolves to recommend that S/Shri (1) Shri Wasim Sadiq Nargal, (2) Nazir Ahmed Beig, and (3) Smt. Sindhu Sharma, Advocates & (4) Shri Rashid Ali Dar, Judicial Officer be appointed as Judges of the Jammu & Kashmir High Court. Their *inter se* seniority be fixed as per the existing practice.

( Dipak Misra ), C.J.I.

( J. Chelameswar ), J.

( Ranjan Gogoi ), J.

April 06, 2018.